

# EXHIBIT A

1 Diversified Reporting Services, Inc.

2 RPTS CARR

3 HIF084160

4

5

6 DISINFORMATION NATION: SOCIAL MEDIA'S

7 ROLE IN PROMOTING EXTREMISM AND MISINFORMATION

8 Thursday, March 25, 2021

9 House of Representatives,

10 Subcommittee on Communications and Technology,

11 joint with

12 Subcommittee on Consumer Protection and Commerce,

13 Committee on Energy and Commerce,

14 Washington, D.C.

15

16

17

18 The subcommittees met, pursuant to notice, at 12:02

19 p.m., via Webex, Hon. Michael F. Doyle [chairman of the

20 Subcommittee on Communications and Technology] presiding.

21 Present from the Subcommittee on Communications and

22 Technology: Representatives Doyle, McNerney, Clarke, Veasey,

23 McEachin, Soto, O'Halleran, Rice, Eshoo, Butterfield, Matsui,

24 Welch, Cardenas, Kelly, Craig, Fletcher, Pallone (ex

25 officio); Latta, Scalise, Guthrie, Kinzinger, Johnson, Long,

107 before Congress since the deadly attack on the Capitol on  
108 January 6th. That event was not just an attack on our  
109 democracy and our electoral process, but an attack on every  
110 member of this committee and in the Congress.

111 Many of us were on the House floor and in the Capitol  
112 when that attack occurred, and we were forced to stop our  
113 work of certifying the election and retreat to safety, some  
114 of us wearing gas masks and fearing for our lives. We fled  
115 as a mob desecrated the Capitol, the House floor, and our  
116 democratic process. People died that day, and hundreds were  
117 seriously injured.

118 That attack, and movement that motivated it, started and  
119 was nourished on your platforms. Your platforms suggested  
120 groups for people to join, videos they should view, and posts  
121 they should like, driving this movement forward with  
122 terrifying speed and efficiency.

123 FBI documents show that many of these individuals used  
124 your platforms to plan, recruit, and execute this attack.  
125 According to independent research, users on Facebook were  
126 exposed 1.1 billion times to misinformation related to the  
127 election last year alone despite changes to your policies and  
128 claims that you have removed election misinformation.

129 Our Nation is in the middle of a terrible pandemic.  
130 Nearly 550,000 Americans have lost their lives to this deadly  
131 disease, more than any other country on the planet. And an

132 independent study found that on Facebook alone, that users  
133 across five countries, including the United States, were  
134 exposed to COVID disinformation an estimated 3.8 billion  
135 times, again despite claims of fixes and reforms.

136 And now, as the Biden administration is working to  
137 implement the American Rescue Plan and get vaccines in  
138 people's arms, we are faced with waves of disinformation on  
139 social media about the safety and efficacy of these shots.  
140 These vaccines are the best chance we have to fight this  
141 virus, and the content that your websites are still  
142 promoting, still recommending, and still sharing is one of  
143 the biggest reasons people are refusing the vaccine.

144 And things haven't changed. My staff found content on  
145 YouTube telling people not to get vaccines, and was  
146 recommended to similar videos. The same was true on  
147 Instagram, where it was not only easy to find vaccine  
148 disinformation, but platforms recommended similar post. The  
149 same thing happened on Facebook, except they also had anti-  
150 vax groups to suggest as well. And Twitter was no different.  
151 If you go to any of these superspreader accounts that remain  
152 up despite the policies meant to curb this anti-vax content,  
153 you will see this content.

154 Now, understand this. You can take this content down.  
155 You can reduce division. You can fix this. But you choose  
156 not to. We saw your platforms remove ISIS terrorist content.

236           \*Mr. Latta. Serious problems continue to persist, and  
237 I wonder how much you are truly dedicating to combating  
238 these actions. What actions are you taking to educate  
239 Americans about the dangers of using your site, especially  
240 the dangers for kids?

241           As ranking member of the Subcommittee on Communications  
242 and Technology, we have oversight of any change made to  
243 Section 230 of the Communications Decency Act. Section 230  
244 provides you with liability protection for content  
245 moderation decisions made in good faith. Based on recent  
246 actions, however, it is clear that in your definition of  
247 good faith, moderation includes censoring viewpoints you  
248 disagree with and establishing a faux independent appeals  
249 process that doesn't make its content moderation decisions  
250 based on American principles of free expression. I find  
251 that highly concerning.

252           I look forward to today's hearing as an important step  
253 in reconsidering the extent to which Big Tech deserves to  
254 retain the significant liability protection. And with that,  
255 Mr. Chairman, I yield back the balance of my time.

256           \*Mr. Doyle. Thank you. The gentleman yields back.

257           The chair now recognizes Chair Schakowsky, chair of the  
258 Subcommittee on Consumer Protection and Commerce, for five  
259 minutes for her opening statement.

260           \*Ms. Schakowsky. Thank you. It is a pleasure to co-  
261 chair this meeting with you.

262           I want to welcome our witnesses and thank them for  
263 coming. It is not an exaggeration to say that your  
264 companies have fundamentally and permanently transformed our  
265 very culture and our understanding of the world. Much of  
266 this is for good, but it is also true that our country, our  
267 democracy, even our understanding of what is truth has been  
268 harmed by the proliferation and dissemination of  
269 misinformation and extremism, all of which has deeply  
270 divided us.

271           What our witnesses today need to take away from this  
272 hearing is that self-regulation has come to the end of its  
273 road, and that this democracy, this democratic -- the people  
274 that you see before you, elected by the people, is preparing  
275 to move forth with legislation and regulation.

276           The regulation that we seek should not attempt to limit  
277 constitutionally protected freedom of speech, but it must  
278 hold platforms accountable when they are used to incite  
279 violence and hatred or, as in the case of the COVID pandemic,  
280 spread misinformation that costs thousands of lives.

281           All three of the companies that are here today run  
282 platforms that are hotbeds of misinformation and  
283 disinformation. And despite all the promises and new  
284 policies to match, disinformation was rampant in the 2020

285 election, especially targeting vulnerable communities. For  
286 example, Spanish language ads run by the Trump campaign  
287 falsely accused President Biden of being endorsed by  
288 Venezuelan President Maduro.

289       The spread of disinformation fed upon itself until it  
290 arrived at the Capitol of the United States on January 6th,  
291 which cost five lives. The lives lost in the insurgency were  
292 not the first cases of these platforms' failure, nor even the  
293 worst. In 2018, Facebook admitted a genocide of the Rohingya  
294 people in Myanmar was planned and executed on Facebook.

295       2020 saw the rise of coronavirus disinformation on  
296 Facebook platforms, including the playing of the -- they  
297 called it "The Plandemic." This film got 1.8 million views  
298 and 150,000 shares before it was removed. Disinformation  
299 like Plandemic made people skeptical of the need for vaccines  
300 and almost certainly cost -- contributed to the horrible loss  
301 of life during the pandemic. Disinformation also hops  
302 platforms to spread viruses. Disinformation also hops from  
303 platform to platform. The Plandemic actually was first on  
304 YouTube before it was on Facebook and Instagram and Twitter.

305       Misinformation regarding the election dropped 73 percent  
306 across social media platforms after Twitter permanently  
307 suspended Trump as well as -- and also the Capitol insurgency  
308 and QAnon.

309       But the question really is: What took so long? The

310 witnesses here today have demonstrated time and time again  
311 that they do not -- that self-regulation has not worked.  
312 They must be held accountable for allowing disinformation and  
313 misinformation to spread. And that is why I will be  
314 introducing the Online Consumer Protection Act, which I hope  
315 will earn bipartisan support. And thank you. I will yield  
316 back.

317 \*Mr. Doyle. The gentlelady yields back.

318 The chair now recognizes Mr. Bilirakis, ranking member  
319 for the Subcommittee on Consumer Protection and Commerce, for  
320 five minutes for his opening remarks.

321 \*Mr. Bilirakis. Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I appreciate  
322 it. Thank you for participating in today's hearing, all the  
323 witnesses and the members.

324 I have been thinking about this hearing since our side  
325 first requested this hearing last year. My time in college  
326 has provided me enough knowledge about the history of the  
327 committee to know what the Telecommunications Act was and,  
328 importantly, what it wasn't. Components of that law have  
329 been struck down by the courts, while other provisions are  
330 interpreted and applied differently than first conceived.  
331 This is all a departure from congressional intent.

332 Regardless of what one thinks of whether all of the  
333 Communications Decency Act was the right approach, the same  
334 members that voted for Section 230 voted for that entire



385 us want to damage entrepreneurs. What I do want to hear is  
386 what you will do to bring our country back from the fringes  
387 and stop the poisonous practices that drive depression,  
388 isolation, and suicide, and instead cooperate with law  
389 enforcement to protect our citizens.

390 Our kids are being lost while you say you will try to do  
391 better, as we have heard countless time already. We need  
392 true transparency and real change. We need, again, not empty  
393 promises from you, and we have heard that over and over  
394 again. The fear you should have coming into this hearing  
395 today isn't that you are going to get upbraided by a Member  
396 of Congress. It is that our committee knows how to get  
397 things done when we come together. We can do this with you  
398 or without you. And we will.

399 Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I yield back.

400 \*Mr. Doyle. The gentleman yields back.

401 The chair now recognizes Mr. Pallone, chairman of the  
402 full committee, for five minutes for his opening statement.

403 \*The Chairman. Thank you, Chairman Doyle and  
404 Schakowsky, for this very important hearing. We are here  
405 today because the spread of disinformation and extremism has  
406 been growing online, particularly on social media, where  
407 there are little to no guardrails in place to stop it.

408 And unfortunately, this disinformation and extremism  
409 doesn't just stay online. It has real-world, often dangerous

410 and even violent, consequences. And the time has come to  
411 hold online platforms accountable for their part in the rise  
412 of disinformation and extremism.

413 According to a survey conducted by Pew earlier this  
414 month, 30 percent of Americans are still hesitant or simply  
415 do not want to take the COVID-19 vaccine. On January 6, our  
416 Nation's Capitol was violently attacked. This month,  
417 Homeland Security Secretary Mayorkas identified domestic  
418 violent extremism as the "greatest threat" to the United  
419 States. And crimes against Asian Americans have risen by  
420 nearly 150 percent since the beginning of the COVID-19  
421 pandemic.

422 Five years ago, during the 2016 Presidential elections,  
423 Facebook, Google, and Twitter were warned about -- but simply  
424 ignored -- their platforms' role in spreading disinformation.  
425 And since then, the warnings have continued but the problem has  
426 only gotten worse.

427 Only after public outrage and pressure did these  
428 companies make inadequate attempts to appease critics and  
429 lawmakers. But despite the public rebuke, Wall Street  
430 continued to reward the companies' strategy to promote  
431 misinformation and disinformation by driving their stock prices  
432 even higher.

433 And now, despite repeated promises to seriously tackle  
434 this crisis, Facebook, Google, and Twitter instead routinely

435 make minor changes to their policies in response to the public  
436 relations crisis of the day. And they will change some  
437 underlying internal policy that may or may not be related to  
438 the problem. But that is it. The underlying problem remains.

439 So Mr. Chairman, it is now painfully clear that neither  
440 the market nor public pressure will force these social media  
441 companies to take the aggressive action they need to take to  
442 eliminate disinformation and extremism from their platforms.  
443 And, therefore, it is time for Congress and this committee to  
444 legislate and realign these companies' incentives.

445 Today our laws give these companies and their leaders a  
446 blank check to do nothing. Rather than limit the spread of  
447 disinformation, Facebook, Google, and Twitter have created  
448 business models that exploit the human brain's preference for  
449 divisive content to get Americans hooked on their platform, at  
450 the expense of the public interest.

451 It isn't just that social media companies are allowing  
452 disinformation to spread -- it is that, in many cases, they are  
453 actively amplifying and spreading it themselves. And fines, to  
454 the extent they are levied at all, have simply become the cost  
455 of doing business.

456 The dirty truth is that they are relying on algorithms to  
457 purposefully promote conspiratorial, divisive, or extremist  
458 content so they can take more money in ad dollars. And this is  
459 because the more outrageous and extremist the content, the more

460 engagement and views these companies get from their users. And  
461 more views equal more money, Mr. Chairman. That is what it is  
462 all about, more money.

463       It is crucial to understand that these companies aren't  
464 just mere bystanders -- they are playing an active role in the  
465 meteoric rise of disinformation and extremism because they make  
466 money on it. So when a company is actually promoting this  
467 harmful content, I question whether existing liability  
468 protections should apply.

469       Members on this Committee have suggested legislative  
470 solutions and introduced bills. The Committee is going to  
471 consider all these options so that we can finally align the  
472 interests of these companies with the interests of the public  
473 and hold the platforms and their CEOs accountable when they  
474 stray.

475       That is why you are here today, Mr. Zuckerberg,  
476 Mr. Pichai, and Mr. Dorsey. You have failed to meaningfully  
477 change after your platforms played a role in fomenting  
478 insurrection, in abetting the spread the virus, and trampling  
479 Americans civil liberties.

480       And while it may be true that some bad actors will shout  
481 fire in a crowded theater, by promoting harmful content, your  
482 platforms are handing them a megaphone to be heard in every  
483 theater across the country and the world. Your business model  
484 itself has become the problem.

1576 something that we try to study, and I am --

1577 \*Ms. Rodgers. Can you say yes or no? I am sorry.

1578 \*Mr. Zuckerberg. I believe the answer is yes.

1579 \*Ms. Rodgers. Okay. Mr. Doyle, has Twitter?

1580 \*Mr. Dorsey. I don't believe so, but we will follow up  
1581 with you.

1582 \*Ms. Rodgers. Okay. Mr. Pichai, has Google conducted  
1583 any research on the effect your products are having on the  
1584 mental health of children?

1585 \*Mr. Pichai. We consult widely with expert third  
1586 parties on this area, including SAMHSA and other mental  
1587 health organizations, and invest a lot of time and effort in  
1588 this area.

1589 \*Ms. Rodgers. Okay. I would like to see that. It  
1590 sounds like you have studied extremism. Let's get focused on  
1591 our children.

1592 \*Mr. Doyle. The gentlelady's time is expired.  
1593 The chair now recognizes Mr. Rush for five minutes.

1594 Bobby, you need to unmute. There you go. Nope, you are  
1595 still muted.

1596 \*Mr. Rush. I want to thank you, Mr. Chairman. We all  
1597 agree that social media sites should not be tools for stoking  
1598 racial division or exacerbating racial injustice. However,  
1599 there is a broad finding of research that demonstrates the  
1600 disproportionate effects of disinformation and white

1601 supremacy extremism on women and people of color, especially  
1602 black people.

1603       We have seen, and continue to see, that too often social  
1604 media sites put their earnings before equality. Simply  
1605 stated, your corporations carelessly put profits over people.  
1606 Misinformation, outlandish conspiracy theories, and  
1607 incendiary content targeting minorities remains firmly, and  
1608 social media companies, your companies, are profiting from  
1609 hate and racism on these platforms by harnessing data and  
1610 generating advertising revenue from such content.

1611       There is only one comparison that remotely approaches  
1612 the avarice and moral discrepancy of your companies, and that  
1613 is the slavetocracy burden of our Nation's shameful and  
1614 inhumane and most difficult dark days in the past.

1615       This is the very reason why I ask Mr. Dorsey, I remember  
1616 you at our 2018 hearing to commit to commissioning and  
1617 independent third party civil rights audit of Twitter. This  
1618 response at the hearing was followed up with a joint letter  
1619 from Chairman Pallone and myself confirming that commitment.

1620       It is three years later, and I am still waiting,  
1621 Mr. Dorsey, for the results of that audit. Where is that  
1622 audit, Mr. Dorsey?

1623       \*Mr. Dorsey. Thank you. We have taken another  
1624 approach, which is to work with civil rights orgs on a  
1625 regular basis. We have regular conversations with civil

1626 rights orgs multiple times a year.

1627 \*Mr. Rush. Mr. Dorsey, where is the audit that Members  
1628 of Congress, including the chairman of the committee -- where  
1629 is the audit that we asked you and you agreed to forward?

1630 \*Mr. Dorsey. We don't have it. We sought a different  
1631 approach with --

1632 \*Mr. Rush. I don't have it, either, and I thought that  
1633 you were being very, very disingenuous. As a matter of fact,  
1634 I thought that you had lied to the committee and you should  
1635 be condemned for that. And I can't wait until we come up  
1636 with legislation that will deal with you and your cohorts in  
1637 a very, very effective way. This was nothing but an empty  
1638 promise that you made.

1639 You haven't taken this issue seriously, and Mr. Dorsey I  
1640 as a black man in America, my experiences are different from  
1641 your experiences. This audit is very, very important to me  
1642 and to those who are similarly situated just as I am.  
1643 Facebook, to their credit, has completed an audit. And there  
1644 is no reason, simply no reason under the sun, that  
1645 corporation as large as yours should not have completed that  
1646 audit.

1647 Mr. Dorsey, has Twitter evaluated the disparate impact  
1648 from COVID-19 misinformation on the African American  
1649 community, and simply has not even attempted to identify  
1650 messages to combat COVID-19 misinformation targeted at

1651 African Americans and emphasized reliable, trustworthy  
1652 medical information?

1653 \*Mr. Dorsey. Yes on both. And we review with civil  
1654 rights orgs on a regular basis. That is the solution we  
1655 chose.

1656 \*Mr. Doyle. The gentleman's time is expired.  
1657 The chair now recognizes Mr. Upton for five minutes.

1658 \*Mr. Upton. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

1659 As I listen to this hearing, like it or not, it sounds  
1660 like everybody on both sides of the aisle is not very happy.  
1661 I think we all believe that there is a lot of responsibility  
1662 that should be shared for some of the issues that we have  
1663 raised today by the three of you. And I would just offer --  
1664 or speculate, I guess you could say -- that we are going to  
1665 see some changes in Section 230.

1666 The President, former President Trump, vetoed a pretty  
1667 big bill, the defense bill, earlier last year over this very  
1668 issue because he wanted the total repeal and he didn't get  
1669 it. But I know that the Senate now has got some legislation  
1670 that is pending that is looking at a couple reforms. And my  
1671 sense is that we may see something here in the near future as  
1672 well.

1673 I serve as one of only two House members on the  
1674 Commission on Combating Synthetic Opioid Trafficking. It is  
1675 a multi-Federal agency. It is co-chaired by David Trone in



1815 fear, anxiety, anger, and that includes deadly, deadly  
1816 misinformation.

1817       The Center for Countering Digital Hate found that the  
1818 "Explore" and "Suggested Posts" parts of Instagram are  
1819 littered with COVID misinformation, election disinformation,  
1820 and QAnon posts. So this is dangerous, and it is why  
1821 Representative Schakowsky and I are doing a bill that is  
1822 going to ban this business model of surveillance advertising.

1823       So are you willing to redesign your products to  
1824 eliminate your focus on addicting users to your platforms at  
1825 all costs? Yes or no?

1826       \*Mr. Zuckerberg. Congresswoman, as I said before, the  
1827 teams that design our algorithm --

1828       \*Ms. Eshoo. Never mind. I think -- let me just say  
1829 this, and I think it is irritating all of us, and that is  
1830 that no one seems to know the word "yes" or the word "no."  
1831 Which one is it? If you don't want to answer, just say, "I  
1832 don't want to answer." So yes or no?

1833       \*Mr. Zuckerberg. Congressman, these are nuanced issues  
1834 and --

1835       \*Ms. Eshoo. Okay. So I am going to say that is a no.

1836       To Mr. Doyle, as chairwoman of the Health Subcommittee,  
1837 I think that you need to eliminate all COVID misinformation  
1838 and not label or reduce its spread but remove it. I looked  
1839 at a tweet this morning. Robert Kennedy, Jr. links the death

1840 of baseball legend Hank Aaron to the COVID vaccine even  
1841 though fact-checkers debunked the story. The tweet has 9,000  
1842 retweets.

1843 Will you take this down, and why haven't you? And also,  
1844 why haven't you banned the 12 accounts that are spewing its  
1845 deadly COVID misinformation? This could cost lives.

1846 \*Mr. Dorsey. No, we won't take it down because it  
1847 didn't violate our policy. So we have a clear policy in  
1848 place --

1849 \*Ms. Eshoo. What kind of policy is that? Is it a  
1850 policy for misinformation?

1851 \*Mr. Dorsey. No.

1852 \*Mr. Doyle. The gentlelady's time is expired.

1853 The chair recognizes Mr. Scalise. Is Mr. Scalise here?

1854 \*Mr. Scalise. Thank you.

1855 \*Mr. Doyle. Ah, there we go.

1856 \*Mr. Scalise. Yes. Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I want to  
1857 thank you for having this hearing. I want to thank our three  
1858 witnesses for coming as well. Clearly, you are seeing a lot  
1859 of concern being expressed by members on both sides, both  
1860 Republican and Democrat, about the way that your social media  
1861 platforms are run, and especially as it relates to the  
1862 fairness and equal treatment of people.

1863 I know I have had a lot of concerns; shared it with some  
1864 of you individually over the last few years about whether it

3559 ongoing right now. According to the National Center on  
3560 Sexual Exploitation, a teenage boy, a victim of child sex  
3561 trafficking, had images of his abuse posted on Twitter. One  
3562 of those videos went viral, and he became the target of  
3563 bullying to the point of being suicidal. He contacted you to  
3564 alert you that his sex abuse images were on your platform.  
3565 You failed to take them down. His mother contacted you to  
3566 alert you, and again you failed to take them down.

3567       They called the police and they followed up with you  
3568 with a police report. Your support center told the family  
3569 that after review, the illegal video was not a violation of  
3570 your terms of service. In the meantime, the illegal video  
3571 accrued over 167,000 views.

3572       It took a threat from a Homeland Security agent to Get  
3573 Twitter to take down the video. Even then you took no action  
3574 against the accounts that were sharing it and continue to  
3575 share sexually explicit videos of minors in clear violation  
3576 of the law and in clear violation of your duties under  
3577 Section 230 of the Communications Decency Act, as they were  
3578 passed.

3579       So in the eyes of Twitter, it is better to be a  
3580 pedophile pornographer, a woke racist, or a state sponsor of  
3581 terror than it is to be a conservative, even a conservative  
3582 President. You have abused the Section 230 liability shield  
3583 we gave you to protect children, and used it to silence

3584 conservatives instead.

3585       As we have heard today, your abuses of your privilege  
3586 are far too numerous to be explained away and far too serious  
3587 to ignore. So it is time for your liability shield to be  
3588 removed. Your immunity shield and the immunity shield of  
3589 other woke companies who choose to score political points  
3590 with their immunity shields rather than protect children.

3591       My colleagues have been asking you if you deserve to  
3592 continue to receive immunity under Section 230. Let me  
3593 answer the question for you. No, you don't. You all think  
3594 you do, but you don't because you continue to do a disservice  
3595 to that law and its intent.

3596       The United States constitution has the First Amendment,  
3597 and that should be your guide. Protecting the speech of  
3598 users of your platform instead of trading them in like  
3599 hostages and forcing things through algorithms to lead them  
3600 down a path.

3601       The American people really are tired of you abusing your  
3602 rights, abandoning their values. So one of the Christian  
3603 leaders that you banned, Mr. Dorsey, had as her last post a  
3604 scripture verse that you took down. And I want to leave it  
3605 here today, Psalm 34:14. Depart from evil and do good. See  
3606 peace and pursue it. Rather than silence that wise advice, I  
3607 strongly suggest that you follow it.

3608       Now, I have heard a lot of stuff on this hearing today

3609 about 230 protections. I challenge my colleagues to really  
3610 get serious about doing something about this liability shield  
3611 so that we do have a fair and free internet and people aren't  
3612 censored.

3613 With that, Mr. Chairman, I yield back.

3614 \*Mr. Doyle. The gentleman's time is expired.

3615 The chair recognizes Ms. Kelly for five minutes.

3616 \*Ms. Kelly. Thank you, Mr. Chair. Thank you to the  
3617 witnesses who are testifying today.

3618 The business model for your platforms is quite simple:  
3619 Keep users engaged. The more time people spend on social  
3620 media, the more data harvested and targeted ads sold. To  
3621 building that engagement, social media platforms amplify  
3622 content that gets attention. That can be cat videos or  
3623 vacation pictures, but too often it means content that is  
3624 incendiary, contains conspiracy theories or violence.

3625 Algorithms in your platforms can actively funnel users  
3626 from the mainstream to the fringe, subjecting users to more  
3627 extreme content, all to maintain user engagement. This is a  
3628 fundamental flaw in your business model that mere warning  
3629 labels, temporary suspension of some accounts, and even  
3630 content moderation cannot address. And your company's  
3631 insatiable desire to maintain user engagement will continue  
3632 to give such content a safe haven if doing so improves your  
3633 bottom line.

4444 disinformation campaigns that specifically targeted American  
4445 service members and victims. I am just curious if you know  
4446 how many public groups with the word "veteran" or public  
4447 pages with the word "veteran" did you remove from your  
4448 platform after January 6th in association with misinformation  
4449 about the 2020 election or the attack on the Capitol?

4450 \*Mr. Zuckerberg. Congresswoman, I don't know the answer  
4451 off the top of my head, but I would be happy to get back to  
4452 you with that.

4453 \*Miss Rice. Thank you. We believe that you should be  
4454 tracking that information. Your platform was in fact a crime  
4455 scene after January 6, and we need that information and data  
4456 to understand how the attack happened.

4457 I want to thank all three of you for coming here today  
4458 and spending so much time with us. I yield back,  
4459 Mr. Chairman. Thank you.

4460 \*Mr. Doyle. The gentlelady yields back.

4461 The chair recognizes Mr. Armstrong for five minutes. Is  
4462 Mr. Armstrong here? You need to unmute, Kelly.

4463 \*Mr. Armstrong. All right. Sorry about that. Can you  
4464 hear me?

4465 \*Mr. Doyle. Yes. We can hear you.

4466 \*Mr. Armstrong. All right. Thank you.

4467 No other industry receives such bipartisan scrutiny --  
4468 disinformation, content moderation, de-platforming,

4719 try eventually?

4720           \*Mr. Zuckerberg. Congresswoman, if what you are asking  
4721 is are we ever going to be perfect, the answer is no. I  
4722 think that there will always be some mistakes, but I think we  
4723 will get increasingly accurate over time. So for example, a  
4724 few years back, we identified --

4725           \*Ms. Craig. Mr. Zuckerberg, I only have a couple of  
4726 minutes or one minutes left, so I am going to continue here.

4727           As has been mentioned repeatedly throughout today, we  
4728 just don't have faith that your companies have the proper  
4729 incentives to proactively contemplate and address basic human  
4730 rights. With that in mind, would you support legislation  
4731 requiring social media companies to have an Office of Civil  
4732 Rights reporting to the CEO, and that would mean you would  
4733 have to reconsider your corporate structure, including the  
4734 civil rights and human rights of the trans community?

4735           \*Mr. Zuckerberg. Congresswoman, we took the  
4736 unprecedented step of hiring a VP of civil rights, and I  
4737 think we are one of the only companies that has done  
4738 something similar to what you are saying.

4739           \*Ms. Craig. Well, I hope that you do better, then,  
4740 because this example I am giving you was completely  
4741 unacceptable. This panel has done something truly rare in  
4742 Washington these days: It has united Democrats and  
4743 Republicans. Your industry cannot be trusted to regulate

4744     itself.

4745             And with that, I yield back.

4746             \*Mr. Doyle. The gentlelady yields back.

4747             The chair now recognizes Mrs. Trahan for five minutes.

4748             \*Mrs. Trahan. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

4749             I would like to turn the focus back to our children. My  
4750 husband and I have five. Our oldest is 27, our youngest is  
4751 6, and over the years I have noticed how technology has been  
4752 increasingly designed to capture their attention. The more  
4753 time my first-grader spends scrolling through an app, the  
4754 less time she is playing outside or enjoying face-to-face  
4755 interactions with us.

4756             Google and Facebook are not only doing a poor job of  
4757 keeping our children under 13 off of YouTube and Instagram,  
4758 as my colleagues have already mentioned today, but you are  
4759 actively onboarding our children onto your ecosystems with  
4760 apps like YouTube Kids, Facebook Messenger Kids, and now we  
4761 are hearing Instagram for Kids. These applications introduce  
4762 our children to social media far too early and include  
4763 manipulative design features intended to keep them hooked.

4764             Mr. Pichai, when a child finishes a video on YouTube or  
4765 YouTube Kids, does the next video automatically play by  
4766 default? And I think this one is a yes or no.

4767             \*Mr. Pichai. Sorry, I was muted. Congresswoman, I have  
4768 children, too. I worry about the time they spend online, and



4869 19 pandemic to the January 6 insurrection, both of which we  
4870 have talked about extensively.

4871 We have seen that the real-world cost of this unchecked  
4872 spread of disinformation is in lies. And like my colleagues,  
4873 I worry that the structure of many social media companies,  
4874 including those we have before us today, prioritize  
4875 engagement, including engagement with provocative or  
4876 extremist content over responsible corporate citizenship.

4877 So one of my greatest concerns regarding how extremist  
4878 content and disinformation is allowed to spread on your  
4879 platform is the lack of data transparency when it comes to  
4880 independent analysis. Now, everyone has claimed they have an  
4881 internal system, that it is about the systems, that you need  
4882 good systems to remove and delete disinformation and  
4883 extremist content.

4884 But we have no way to verify how effective those systems  
4885 are. And that is a huge part of the challenge before us. I  
4886 think we all would agree that we need data and information to  
4887 make good policy and to write good legislation, which will be  
4888 coming out of this committee.

4889 So that brings me to a follow-up on my colleague Miss  
4890 Rice's questions about data. As she mentioned, and it is my  
4891 understanding that all three of your platforms chose to  
4892 remove content that was posted regarding the Capitol  
4893 insurrection on January 6. And I think we can all understand

5569 See, they know you have this power and they want to direct  
5570 that power for their own political gain. Mr. Zuckerberg,  
5571 since Facebook was my first love, I am going to direct  
5572 questions at you. And this isn't a trick question, I  
5573 promise.

5574 Do you believe in the spirit of the First Amendment --  
5575 free speech, robust debate, basically liberal values?

5576 \*Mr. Zuckerberg. Yes, absolutely.

5577 \*Mr. Crenshaw. See, my colleagues can't infringe on the  
5578 First Amendment. The American people in their speech are  
5579 protected from government, as they should be. My colleagues,  
5580 this administration, they can't silence pump they disagree  
5581 with no matter how much they want to.

5582 But I do think they want to. Just in this hearing, I  
5583 have heard Democrats complain about misinformation, by which  
5584 they clearly mean political speech they disagree with. They  
5585 have complained today that Prager University content is still  
5586 up. I have heard them accuse conservative veterans of being  
5587 tinfoil hat-wearing extremists, and that opinions on climate  
5588 change that they disagree with should be taken down.

5589 This is quite different from the Republican complaint  
5590 that illegal content needs to be addressed. There is a  
5591 growing number of people in this country that don't believe  
5592 in the liberal values of free speech and free debate. I  
5593 promise you, the death of the First Amendment will come when